

Cultural Transformation through Satellite Cable TV in Pakistan

An Analysis of Audience Perspective

Abdul Waheed Rana*

S.Anwar Iqbal*

Abstract

The paper is the result of extensive field research conducted in major cities and towns in Pakistan during the period 2004-05 and the data was revised during the year 2006-07. The data primarily was collected for a project on social impact of cable satellite television in Pakistan conducted by the authors for Department of Anthropology, Quaid-e-Azam University, and Islamabad under the sponsorship of Higher Education Commission. The primary data which has been used in the paper includes surveys, in-depth interviews, focus group discussions and content analysis of various TV programmes and channels. This paper attempts to answer two basic questions; what is available on satellite TV in terms of contents and how people are responding to the new messages in their social life? The impact of television on Pakistani society is enormous and wide ranging. The country which initially had one television channel has now access to over fifty satellite channels available through a wide cable distribution system. This influx of information has affected the Pakistani culture in multiple ways. All age groups, sexes and political and social institutions have undergone dramatic changes over the last fifteen years with the advent of satellite TV channels in Pakistan. The authors have attempted to analyze the impact of different TV programmes on the society in comparison with State-controlled Public Sector TV – Pakistan Television (PTV). The major areas covered are; the impact on youth, children, women, students and general public. The primary focus is the impact and resulting reaction of various population segments on these programmes. The results of the study suggest that the satellite TV has been received generally in positive sense. However, caution was also voiced by a cross section of society. The impact has been evaluated in cultural perspective using the Anthropological technique of participant observation and in-depth structured and open

* Assistant Chief Mass Media Planning Commission, Government of Pakistan

* Assistant Professor, Department of Anthropology Quaid-e-Azam University Islamabad

ended interviews. It has been concluded that the satellite television channels are not a threat but provide an open arena for information sharing. The role of the state should be as a guide not the controller and custodian. The dismal experience of PTV programming has strengthened the notion that State should stay-away from direct broadcasting activities and venturing to enter into competition with private sector. The people are conscious and cautious of the impact and want electronic media to fight back by strengthening their own cultural value system and traditional modes of living. The changes are natural and not controllable; thus should be seen and taken under the wider perspective of ongoing process of globalization and technology advancement.

Introduction

In Pakistan, television broadcasting has established an intrinsic relation with the public. On the one hand State television lacks research on the audience to uncover its viewing tastes and preferences, while on the other, both public and private means of organizing television feed back on a global, national and regional issues, through drama and entertainment, and the political information necessary for the functioning of democracy has remained absent for almost 25 years till the time, the satellite TV arrived in 1990s. The notion of a specifically nationally defined public service is being undermined by less professional state television. The conception of public service broadcasting, coined in UK by BBC in 1920s, was originally based on the principles of universality and equality of access, as well as the desire to educate the populace while binding them together in a nationally imagined community through a blend of information, education and entertainment. The Pakistanis it seemed were bound together by their inability to adopt other cultures, denial of artistic expressions, and hatred of new thoughts. It is unlikely that any serious attempt could be made today to claim that the nation has a culture in common. The migration of peoples to other continents and the influence of a global culture have shattered national cohesion, although it remains part of a wider nostalgia. But it also gives rise to pessimism, as the market driven multi-channel universe is likely to be based upon low production costs and a conglomerate dominance of news and entertainment. Public service's most recent response is the potential development of more regional programming (PTV national channel for example). The decentralization of program production and content away from the national center has both pluralist and democratic pretensions. There are also profound dangers if regional broadcasting becomes merely a reaction to globalizing processes and only offers a platform for local forms of parochialism. One of the principal features of public service broadcasting is that it allows the nation to enter into conversation with itself is Cable satellite television with more specialist channels successful to provide a plurality of 'quality programming' could further atomize the audience.

At global level, a policy of 'Television without Frontiers' has been adopted along with certain minimal forms of regulation in respect to pornography, violence and racism. This enables nation states to curb the transmission of offensive material. As yet there has been no concerted attempt to regulate the concentration of cross-media, multiple-ownership world-wide. Surprisingly, Pakistan has allowed cross-media ownership in the year 2003. This still leaves us with multiple problems and issues. The most pressing issue here is that culturally and politically Pakistan is very difficult to define. The State itself has recently been struggling to assert a cultural identity of its own in the face of fragmentation and the influx of American culture. Indeed the most important cultural issue facing Pakistan is the current explosion of tensions and terrorism and political hatred. These are obviously not problems that can be solved by Mass Media Policy alone. Although it forms the backcloth of any attempt to rethink its importance in a national context.

Television Theory:

The new global economy of meaning has become an important topic in the anthropological study of commodities and consumerism. Goods are also re-contextualized and reinterpreted at their locus of consumption. We need to apply some critical insights to the study of television in the

Third World . Just as a McDonald's hamburger means something very different in Moscow from what it means in New York , so the drama of *Dallas* has been found to convey very different meanings to Israelis, Algerians, and Italians. Australian aborigines interpret television dramas in ways that would be unintelligible to those who _____

Arnould, E. J. and Richard Wilk (1984), "Why do the Indians Wear Adidas?" *Advances in Consumer Research*, 11: 748-52.

Katz, E. and T. Liebes (1984), "Once Upon a Time, in Dallas ." *Inter media*, 12 (3): 46-72. ——— 1986 "Patterns of Involvement in Television Fiction: A Comparative Study." *European Journal of Communication*, 1 (2): 151-71.

produced the drama in the first place. Fiske argues that even in the countries where they are produced, television programs are open texts subject to a variety of interpretations. The very popularity of television rests on polysemy and ambiguity, on the ability of different groups to find different things in the same program. Existing studies of the television audience have some very important ramifications for our understanding of the global traffic in objects and meanings, of the process whereby the global becomes localized. One finding is that the message of television is interpreted and absorbed socially, rather than individually. Television messages are mediated in the social context of talk *about* television. (For example, violent programs do not make children prone to or inured to violence when their parents and friends talk about television violence with disapproval. Studies consistently find that conversation is an essential part of television watching; the meaning of the program acquires cultural and social relevance through interpretive discourse.

In asking about the impact of television on families around the world, Lull finds the most universal change is that television creates a new genre of "television talk" within existing family interaction. But what does this genre of talk do to the messages from the box? Most theorists agree that television talk allows viewers to negotiate different poses, or distances in relation to the program. The various classifications of these poses can be combined into a set of three (based on works by Hall 1981; Livingstone 1990; Morley 1980, 1988; Ang 1985; and Katz and Liebes 1984, 1986). A viewer who is *dominated* places no distance between himself and the program, identifying closely with the characters and situation in a completely uncritical way. Katz and Liebes focus on the emotional fix of the viewer on the program,

Michaels, Eric (1988), " Hollywood Iconography: A Warlpiri Reading." In *Television and its Audience: International Research Perspectives*. Phillip Drummond and Richard Patterson, eds., pp. 109-24. London : BFI Publishing.

Fiske, John (1986), "Television: Polysemy and Popularity." *Critical Studies in Mass Communications*, 3 (4): 391. 08. Friedman, Jonathan 1990, "The Political Economy of Elegance." *Culture and History*,

Drummond, Phillip and Richard Patterson eds. (1988), *Television and Its Audience: International Research Perspectives*. London : British Film Institute.

Katz, E. and T. Liebes (1984), "Once Upon a Time, in Dallas ." *Inter media*, 12 (3): 46-72. ———
1986 "Patterns of Involvement in Television Fiction: A Comparative Study." *European Journal of Communication*, 1 (2): 151-71.

Mahmood, S., & Shaukat, N. (1993), *The constitution of the Islamic Republic of Pakistan* :
Lahore : Lull (1948).

Hall, Stuart (1981), Information and Broadcasting. Notes on Deconstructing "The Popular." In
People's History and Socialist Theory. R. Samuel, ed., pp. 227-40. London : Routledge and
Kegan Paul.

Katz, E. and T. Liebes (1984), "Once Upon a Time, in Dallas ." *Inter media*, 12 (3): 46-72. ———
1986 "Patterns of Involvement in Television Fiction: A Comparative Study." *European Journal of Communication*, 1 (2): 151-71.

Michaels, Eric (1988), " Hollywood Iconography: A Warlpiri Reading." In *Television and its Audience: International Research Perspectives*. Phillip Drummond and Richard Patterson, eds.,
pp. 109-24. London : BFI Publishing.

Fiske, John (1986), "Television: Polysemy and Popularity." *Critical Studies in Mass Communications*, 3 (4): 391. 08. Friedman, Jonathan 1990, "The Political Economy of Elegance." *Culture and History*,

Drummond, Phillip and Richard Patterson eds. (1988), *Television and Its Audience: International Research Perspectives*. London : British Film Institute.

Katz, E. and T. Liebes (1984), "Once Upon a Time, in Dallas ." *Inter media*, 12 (3): 46-72. ———
1986 "Patterns of Involvement in Television Fiction: A Comparative Study." *European Journal of Communication*, 1 (2): 151-71.

Mahmood, S., & Shaukat, N. (1993), *The constitution of the Islamic Republic of Pakistan* :
Lahore : Lull (1948).

Hall, Stuart (1981), Information and Broadcasting. Notes on Deconstructing "The Popular." In
People's History and Socialist Theory. R. Samuel, ed., pp. 227-40. London : Routledge and
Kegan Paul.

while Ang sees an element of fantasy, at Livingstone would call "romantic." The viewer confuses the program with reality, relating to the characters as real people, sometimes as even *more* real than the mundane. This implies that dominated viewers uncritically absorb and internalize the hegemonic messages from the box, accepting and integrating them into their lives. To Leal this position is also mystical, and the television becomes a fetish imbued with Rabian characteristics.

At the other extreme is Hall's *oppositional* stance, where the viewer has a critical distance from the program that allows judgment about truth, the motives of its producers, and the impact of the medium itself. The position has been labeled "ironic", "cynical" (Livingstone 1990), and "moralistic" Viewers perceive a message in the box and reject it, or they extract a meaning from the program that was not intentionally coded there, for example that *Dallas* is about the evils of patriarchy, or of capitalism. In between there is a *negotiated* position, where the viewer does not dispute the meaning of the program, but interprets and adapts it in light of his own experience and interest. This "pragmatic" and "realistic" position allows the viewers to relate the events in the program to their own lives. They accept the program as a fantasy, but one that resonates and reflects; they are willing to identify with some things and reject others in a creative process of engaged participation. The way they use and reintegrate meanings has been likened to "poaching" [Silj et al. 1988].

Ang, Ien (1985), *Watching Dallas: Soap Opera and the Melodramatic Imagination*, London : Methuen .

Leal, G.T. (1990), Pakistan . In G.T. Kurian (Ed.), *World press encyclopedia* (pp. 707-714). London : Mansell Publishing.

Hall, Stuart (1981), *Information and Broadcasting. Notes on Deconstructing "The Popular."* In *People's History and Socialist Theory*. R. Samuel, ed., pp. 227-40. London : Routledge and Kegan Paul.

Ang, Ien (1985), *Watching Dallas: Soap Opera and the Melodramatic Imagination*, London : Methuen .

Katz, E. and T. Liebes (1984), "Once Upon a Time, in Dallas ." *Inter media*, 12 (3): 46-72. ——— 1986 "Patterns of Involvement in Television Fiction: A Comparative Study." *European Journal of Communication*, 1 (2): 151-71.

Katz, E. and T. Liebes (1984), "Once Upon a Time, in Dallas ." *Inter media*, 12 (3): 46-72. ——— 1986 "Patterns of Involvement in Television Fiction: A Comparative Study." *European Journal of Communication*, 1 (2): 151-71.

Ang, Ien (1985), *Watching Dallas: Soap Opera and the Melodramatic Imagination*, London : Methuen .

Silj (1988), *The Mass Media and Modern Society*, N.Y.

predictor of reading; women are dominated by soap opera, while men are more distanced. Katz and Liebes found cultural differences that explain viewers' readings of *Dallas* ; Israeli Arabs were moralistic and distanced, while Moroccan Jews were pragmatic, and American Jews were engaged.

Another tempting map links types of reading to social rank; the educated upper classes are capable of critical distance, while the poor have a direct and uncritical relationship to the

program that leads to their domination. This hypothesis can be supported by several studies, including Kottak's in Brazil, that find greater criticism of television at higher income and educational levels (as well as with longer length of exposure to the medium).

The idea that the poor are dominated while the rich and educated have critical distance is a folk model of television consumption that is often heard in Pakistan. Middle-and upper-class people are worried about the effects of television on the gullible poor, whose close, uncritical involvement was going to lead to dire cultural effects. The commonly voiced fear was that the poor were taking television "too literally," that they mistook entertainment for reality. Even many of the poor and uneducated people we interviewed said that their neighbors and children were taking television too seriously, believed what they saw and were emotionally affected. Government officials see themselves as stuck between critical elite who want the media controlled, and an engaged, dominated populace interested only in more entertainment.

Television in Pakistan

For most of us, television has become the center *of our* communication lives. Its content entertains us, informs us, and angers us. Yet television content is increasingly the only communication experience that members of modern society have in common. In Pakistan people _____

Morley, D. (1980), *The Nationwide Audience*. London : British Film Institute.

Katz, E. and T. Liebes (1984), "Once Upon a Time, in Dallas ." *Inter media*, 12 (3): 46-72. ———
1986 "Patterns of Involvement in Television Fiction: A Comparative Study." *European Journal of Communication*, 1 (2): 151-71.

Fachel, Jane (1988), The Concept of Live Television; Ontology as Ideology. In *Regarding Television: Critical Approaches - An Anthology*. E. A- Kaplan, ed., pp. 12-22. Frederick , MD : University Publications of America .

Kottak, Conrad (1990), *Prime Time Society*. Belmont , CA : Wadsworth . Leal, Ondina E. 1990, "Popular Taste and the Erudite Repertoire: The Place and Space of Television in Brazil ." *Cultural Studies*, 4 (1): 19-29.

Morley, D. (1980), *The Nationwide Audience*. London : British Film Institute.

Katz, E. and T. Liebes (1984), "Once Upon a Time, in Dallas ." *Inter media*, 12 (3): 46-72. ———
1986 "Patterns of Involvement in Television Fiction: A Comparative Study." *European Journal of Communication*, 1 (2): 151-71.

Fachel, Jane (1988), The Concept of Live Television; Ontology as Ideology. In *Regarding Television: Critical Approaches - An Anthology*. E. A- Kaplan, ed., pp. 12-22. Frederick , MD : University Publications of America .

Kottak, Conrad (1990), *Prime Time Society*. Belmont, CA : Wadsworth . Leal, Ondina E. 1990, "Popular Taste and the Erudite Repertoire: The Place and Space of Television in Brazil ." *Cultural Studies*, 4 (I): 19-29.

value television very high and associate themselves with its discourses very keenly. It has multiple historical, social and economic reasons: the foremost being absence of any other leisure time activity for youth, women and low income groups owing to decrease in economic opportunities changing lifestyles, less out of home entertainment opportunities and tradition of staying at home with family under the four walls. The dependence on television has enormously increased and deteriorating law and order situation has compelled people to stay at home in many parts of the country including small villages. The picture tube has replaced traditional public spheres such as *autaq* in Sindh, *Chopal* in Punjab, *bethak* in NWFP and Baluchistan and small teashops and *Thara* (a sitting place in front of shops and houses) in urban centers. A new public sphere has emerged in the form of television. Pakistani society during the last thirty years has gradually undergone an aesthetic transformation substituting all other entertainments with a singular choice for TV. Radio due to its orthodoxy in content and form, centralized broadcasting and acute lack of professionalism is no more a leisure time activity. Cinema with all its promiscuity and old styled theatrical presentation with no charming faces and impulse touching music has shrunk to a limited audience mostly laborers and out of home bachelors. Parks and public places are not there to offer a fresh breath to entertainment-starved populace. Family gatherings and visiting friend and relatives are a dying tradition. In this scenario the entire responsibility of entertaining, involving, informing and refreshing a melancholous population rests on a small box, we call TV. In such complex situation the role and responsibility of Television and Television producers and media managers has increased manifold. The expectation level has equally expanded enormously. Everybody wants TV to behave like a leader, a reformist, a friend and above all a catharsis chamber. With multiplicity of ethnic, religious, economic and social differences, television is expected to meet the demands of an ethically and ideologically divided population.

State in one hand is strong custodian of electronic media operations, it provides finances, employs media managers and producers, formulate policies, impose regulations and expect wide publicity of its development programs and political activities. Ministry of information and broadcasting is responsible for keeping the media on track: no deviance is permissible what so ever. On the other, the print media-overwhelmingly in private sector enjoys greater freedom. The number of newspapers in Urdu and English languages has increased with state of the art_____

Hamelink, C. (1994), *The Politics of World Communication*. London : Sage.

publishing industry. Satellite broadcasters have entered into the arena of competition with their all necessary information and entertainment cosmetics and contents. International broadcasters are there to challenge the news aired by the state TV; spontaneously providing people excess to live coverage of happenings inside and around the globe.

This too is not the whole story. The penetration of satellite broadcasters through cable is limited to urban centers with a tiny outreach of only less then 20% population. The rural areas and those living in scattered localities in urban areas where cable has not reached are still dependent on

PTV broadcasts. But the impact is indirectly reaching them through socialization with others.

The impact is also reflected on print media which is available but to literates segment of population only. This is a very complex and intricate situation which has covert and overt dimensions. It also elaborates the difficulty in conducting a research on television broadcasting primarily focused cultural and social needs of the people.

Satellite channels first landed in Pakistan in 1992 and an era of direct satellite transmission began. The viewers now have access through their cable connections to over 50 international channels. Of these, ten to twelve Indian channels are watched by Pakistani viewers of all ages.

PTV, which was expected to chart its own course of excellence to face the fierce competition from Indian channels, has unfortunately itself fallen into their mould. The majority of programs on PTV are crude copies of the trivial film based material dished out by the Indian channels. Even the Urdu language has been unnecessarily polluted with English words like in India . PTV is also following the Indian pattern of over-commercializing TV for monetary gains is detrimental to ethical and cultural values and is in direct conflict with the basic agenda set for PTV.

There is no denying of the fact that privately owned Indian Channels STAR and ZTV which have gained their freedom to report news more professionally and discuss political social and economic issues freely with obvious bias have put PTV in the dock. A recent survey carried out by Freedom House, a New York based monitor of civil and political rights worldwide, has rated the measure of the extent to which freedom of expression has been protected in each of the seven SAARC countries. According to the survey which rates countries on a sliding scale of 0 to 100, with 0 representing the most free and 100 the least free, India scored 48, Pakistan 60, Bangladesh 49, Sri Lanka 46, Nepal 52, Bhutan 62 and the Maldives 68. None of these countries qualified as free. Five, i.e. India , Pakistan , Bangladesh , Sri Lanka and Nepal were characterized as partly free, while the remaining two fell in the category of not free.

Cable Distribution in Pakistan

Estimate of the number of people watching television in Pakistan rests largely on guesswork. Although Pakistan , unlike India has retained a system of licensing for television sets till 2006, the number of licenses is not even an approximate guide to the number of households with sets or the number of viewers who have access to them, so official statistics are little help. On the basis of Gallup surveys up to 2006 the number of television sets estimate between 8 and 10 million.

The overall reach of television is considerably lower than in India . But access to satellite TV, which Gallup estimates at 13 per cent of the adult population or 8.5 million adults, is on par with the Indian experience. According to Gallup , in terms of actual numbers, viewing is 'about the same in rural and urban Pakistan ', A greater proportion of urban Pakistanis watch satellite TV. Moreover, by early 2006, the growth rate in urban areas appeared to be increasing down, while in rural areas the novelty of satellite had not yet worn off and the number of dishes was still increasing."

It is in Pakistan 's largest metropolitan city, Karachi , that satellite television is viewed most intensively. Karachi is the only Pakistani city with developed cable systems, which can compare with those in India . Some of these were set up in the 1970s, since the arrival of satellite; however, cable systems have spread to most of the lower middle class and working class areas.

The cabling of more prosperous suburbs has lagged behind poorer localities and has been developed by larger commercial concerns. According to a study conducted in 2006 by the Department of Anthropology, Quaid-e-Azam University , Islamabad and poor localities and even slums are now receiving cable television. But most of these services are operated without official sanction and no figures are forthcoming.

Cable television in Pakistan is subject to strict controls, but until early 2000, when the government began to address the issue of licensing cable operators, there was no separate cable law or regulatory authority; cable operators lived in the some kind of legal limbo. By 2000, cable systems had begun to spread to Lahore and Islamabad but not on a scale to rival the appeal of

Freedom House Survey(1999) USA

Rana,A.waheed and Iqbal,Anwar(2006)Social Impact of Global satellite Broadcasting in Pakistan , Quaid-I-Azam University Islamabad

direct transmissions. Until that *time*, the only legal satellite TV distribution system in Pakistan was a pay-TV system run by Shaheen Pay TV Company. The pay TV system used a microwave system similar to that installed in Kathmandu . It gave excellent quality, but only fewer channels were available. Now the system has been upgraded and a good number of international channels are available through its' modified MMDS Version – Sun TV but in addition to an expensive decoder, there is a charge for the service as well.

Investment in satellite/ cable TV

In Pakistan as per rough estimates the total investment in cable TV business is Rs 8 billion. PTV has been established and expanded through government funding. Similarly a substantial infrastructure cost has been incurred on the balancing and modernization of Radio Pakistan . Based on the licenses issued in the domain of electronic media by PEMRA, it is estimated that around Rs 654 million will be invested in the wireless cable (MMDS), around Rs 580 million in Direct -To- Home Technology, around Rs 154 million in installation of local radio and Rs 2,600 million in satellite TV by the year 2008. Similarly teleport facility could bring an investment of around Rs 500 million in the country. It is estimated that by the year 2008 around Rs 5,363 million investments will be made in the electronic media sector.

Table-1

Estimated Investment in New Establishments By 2007

(Rs. Million)

No.	Electronic Medium	Estimated Investment in new establishments by 2007
1.	Cable TV	8000
2.	Television	2,600
3.	Radio	154
4.	MMDS	654
5.	DTH	580

Source : PEMRA

Employment Generation

At the moment 30,000 people are directly employed in Cable TV business claiming to support 500,000 persons, PTV has 6000 employees. Radio Pakistan has more than 3,000 employees. This sector will become a high potential employment area by 2010. It is expected that Radio can provide direct employment to around 1,000 people while satellite TV has potential to employ up to 4000 people. Direct to home technology can accommodate up to 200 people directly or indirectly associated with it. Cable has the potential to employ around 10,000 people. MMDS technology has the capacity to employ around 1,000 additional people.

Table-2

Estimated Employment Potential in New Establishments

No.	Electronic Medium	Estimated Employment potential in new establishments
1.	Cable TV	30000
2.	Television	6000
3.	Radio	3000
4.	MMDS	1000
5.	DTH	200

Source : PEMRA

Revenue Generation

As per estimates Rs 3.4 billion advertising revenues accrue to electronic media in Pakistan per annum which is targeted to grow to Rs 7 billion by the year 2010. Through subscription it is estimated that Rs 5 billion accrue from cable business currently. It is assumed that with the establishment of new media outlets the share of revenues in electronic media will rise to Rs. 16 billion by 2010.

The Beginning of Satellite Era

In this part of the paper, the satellite programs available in Pakistan and public and professional reactions to them will be discussed. The main focus is on reactions to programs made specifically for Pakistani audiences, particularly on popular entertainment channels like Geo, ARY, Indus Vision, Zee, Sony, Star, CNN, BBC and others which are watched in the metropolitan centers and beyond over a much wider area. The data has been collected from a range of different interviews, discussion groups and surveys which were carried out in the five main Pakistani cities and some small towns and villages over a twelve-month period during 2006 and 2007.

The first beneficiaries of satellite broadcasting were the small English language-knowing audiences in the large cities. They are nonetheless an economically and politically influential audience. But the main target of the popular channels has been the expanding Pakistani middle class with Urdu as its lingua franca. The new popular satellite channels have been powerful agents of a new consumerism. Unlike PTV, which has concentrated on the political and development activities of Pakistan, the satellite channels appeal to the viewer with multiple choices. These channels have affected old social and cultural values, introduced new fusions of the world, and Geo TV in particular, has been the exponent of a new vision for middle class Pakistan in which money and glamour are the top agenda items.

Satellite programs are being watched by all sections of the urban community, from the students of elite colleges to labourers in cities like Lahore and Karachi. But urban youth are a key target group which has been offered a new image of them. Satellite music channels, *ARY Music*, *MTV* and *Channel V*, have played an important role in putting pleasure and consumption much higher up the agenda than in the past.

Another contribution of satellite TV and its talk shows has been to promote far greater openness about issues like human rights, women's rights, questions of choice and career, sexuality and relations with others. For PTV, the pursuits of commercial competition have involved a crisis of identity which has still not been resolved. In many parts of Pakistan, it is losing urban audiences and finding it difficult to win them back.

The English-Speaking Upper Class

English-educated middle class portrays a wide appreciation for satellite channels. Young adults, particularly males, welcome the new access to international news and international sports coverage. There is appreciation for the professionalism of many satellite productions and for better quality documentaries and wildlife programs. But there are also concerns about the ruthless commercialism of the entertainment channels, the morality implicit in some of the serials, the effect of consumerism on children and the lack of serious programming about Pakistan. The other striking finding recorded in the Focus Group Discussions is the dramatic decline in viewing of PTV programs in cable and satellite households. PTV features infrequently in the lists of favorite programs, not only among English-knowing middle class groups but also among Sindhi, Punjabi, Pushto and Urdu speakers. Many middle class viewers have switched to GEO, ARY, Indus, BBC and CNN for news and current affairs, to Zee or Sony for entertainment, to Star, 10 Sports and ESPN for sports, and to Discovery for science, environment

and wildlife. PTV's reach is unrivalled, but in the urban areas it is not doing well, except with the older generation and staunch religious groups.

Discussions held among English-speaking middle class groups in Karachi indicate that satellite TV has been a means of reinforcing their existing preferences. Young middle class professionals working for multinational employers in Karachi watched very little television; they worked long hours and returned home late. A majority said, they preferred reading to watching TV. What they wanted from television was news and business updates and 'something light' for relaxation. Channel preferences included *Geo*, *ARY*, *Star News*, *Star Movies*, *CNN* and *BBC*. There seemed to be no following for *PTV*. In many ways, this kind of group looks outside Pakistan for its role models. Asked about Pakistani culture on television, one discussant said: 'I am not interested in the past.'

Girls and boys of 12 or 13 years of age going to the elite Lahore Cathedral school showed a similar preference for international programs. They liked British comedies, sports, particularly football matches, news and the Discovery Channel. They preferred English horror movies like *The X-files*, saying 'PTV programs don't look real'.

Employees of a Pakistan bank in Lahore were contemptuous of PTV and Urdu soaps. No one with cable watched PTV; they thought the programs and presentation were too poor. One called PTV 'the pits'; a second said: 'They just don't care.' Mostly in their 30s, they watched cable TV for news, current affairs, sports and the occasional film. A surprising trend was witnessed and recorded in Islamabad where participants of a focus group discussion and senior government officers showed similar trends.

Though these illustrations come from major cities of Punjab and Karachi metropolitan, they can be found among English speaking elites in other provinces of the country too. Sindh indicates a similar divide in viewing habits between elite or upper class, which follows English language programs, and the middle class which is happier with Local colour. The upper class has always felt that alienation from local culture was a sign of privilege, a status symbol. In that way, there is continuity in the perception of their own culture. Children of the elite regularly request songs on *MTV* and *Channel V*. The middle class children only watch, but they prefer Urdu channels. They also can't afford calls to Dubai, but those who get to watch 'serious' channels have a higher level of knowledge than their parents.'

A New Culture in the Making

The satellite television has made its greatest impact among the college and university populations of Pakistan because this group is most affected by new trends in language, fashion or behavior. Now satellite television is thrusting the commercial face of Western industrial civilization into almost every metropolitan household and helping to create a new global middle class ethos which affects far larger numbers of people. 'Given certain socio-economic characteristics', said a Pakistani advertising executive, 'we are looking at the same kinds of markets. And advertisements are market driven. So the foundation of a shared culture is already laid. Earlier, the gap between the elite and the rest of the middle class was very wide. Now television is playing a part in leveling those differences, particularly among college students in

metropolitan cities'. As the same executive put it, 'the children of the middle class, with their demand for Nike shoes and Dockers Levis Jeans and Calvin Klein T-shirts, look much the same wherever they live'.

A discussion group among 17- and 18-year old students from the elite Beacon House school and college in Islamabad revealed that most of them spoke English in the school (some at home too) and watched English language television programs. None of the group watched PTV and neither did their parents. VJs from the music channels were definite reference points for style and fashion in music and dress, though most of it was western. Outside the elite groups in Islamabad, Lahore and Karachi, the middle class even in same cities and other large cities like Peshawar or Faisalabad, the music channels were less popular and more controversial. In these cities, traditional values are still well respected and students displayed more resistance to western role models and morals. Among middle class Pushto-speaking students in Peshawar, the boys expressed a preference for news, sports and quizzes, while girls favoured mythological and Urdu satellite serials. However, the girls were openly enthusiastic about TV fashions. 'That is what I am watching each time', said one young woman, '... the hairstyle, the shoes, the clothes.... I watch the music channels only for that'.

A similar University students group in Faisalabad expressed worries and some frustration at the moral values reflected in satellite programs. One participant said, "I get an inferiority complex—when I see all these serials".

Channel V and MTV channel portray a fearer and fashionable world, the promise of more gratification and an entertaining escape from parental and cultural pressures. In all, these Channels are more popular in the big cities than in the small towns. 'In urban areas, the culture is being taken over by something that is not Pakistani', said one student. 'TV has introduced a 'punk' culture. From childhood, kids have taken to wear earrings and singing pop songs. These are the negative effects of TV, said another. Most young Pakistanis deny any disloyalty to their culture or disrespect for their parents. But they acknowledge the power of the new influences. 'Pakistan TV should also go on satellite', said one student. 'That way other people will also know something of our country... It also means that just like Zee, Sony and MTV have a strong impact on our society, similarly Pakistan TV can promote Pakistani culture elsewhere.'

Tele-Play (Dram ad Serials)

Satellite TV has created its greatest ethical and cultural impacts as a result of a new series of tele-play operas which offered the public bolder themes, franker treatment of personal relations, and fewer happy endings. The special and peculiar themes were the hallmarks of satellite television initially, but by the mid-1990s, PTV serials were also exploring similar relationships. PTV had pioneered soap opera in the late 1970s and 1980s with *Afshan*, *Waris*, *Khuda ki basti*, and *heray Ujalay* which carried a message of modernity centering on the family and clan relationship. That was the time when television intended to serve the development goals of the state. Later, in the same decade, PTV also broadcast a number of soap operas offering women new role models and exploring their rights. One of these, *Kiran Kahani*, about a woman's efforts to become an independent person by challenging the highhandedness of her in-laws, proved extremely popular.

By contrast, satellite TV soap operas of the 2000 were tailored more to the demands of the advertisers than to those of the society.

The Impact on Language

A new language, pioneered by Zee TV and later followed by *Geo*, *ARY*, and innumerable *FM* radio Stations throughout Pakistan has come to be known as '*Unglish*' and sometimes '*Minglish*', has caught on with the urban young all over Pakistani metropolis and has become a point of controversy with others. One of the reasons for its popularity is its complete break with the style and preoccupations of the national broadcasters.

Television has produced 'a perceptible change in the usage of language'. In Pakistani urban centers, 'higher classes' are reported to be using more Urdu and English words in everyday language. The 'educated middle classes' are trying to retain the Persian flavor of their language by using 'either pure Urdu or elite English words'.

Mansha Yaad, a writer and Playwright in Islamabad says, 'The concept of purity of language is humbug. I welcome the new trend. This language does not make a fetish whether the word is English or Urdu or Punjabi, as long as it is understood by the majority of listeners.'

There are concerns that the new style is an urban phenomenon which reflects the dominance of the upper middle class, English elite in the new media and a lack of seriousness in communicating with the rest of society, which does not know English. It is a criticism made not just of satellite TV but of many of the new FM radio channels in the big cities. According to radio producer and news editor *Jamal Haider Siddiqui*, 'people with British, American or any other foreign accent gained preference over those with local accents. Entertainment and idle talk became hip over the radio while responsibility was grossly neglected'.

Change in Fashion and Style

A survey of the impact of satellite television in two big cities in Pakistan—Lahore and Karachi provided ample evidence that satellite television serials are stimulating a growing interest in personal appearance and beautification. Though many of those interviewed denied they were imitating the styles of the stars, the proprietor of famous Diplex Beauty Parlour, *Musarrat Misbah* in Lahore said, her clients specifically demanded hair styles from famous models as well as those of Krishman Kapoor and Princess Diana. Even in a smaller town of Gujranwala, clients of Rose Beauty Parlour, requested for the style of famous movie stars and _____

Mansha Yad, Interview, *Daily Jung* July 24, 2007, Islamabad

Shamsuddin, M. (1986), *British press coverage and the role of Pakistani press from independence to the emergence of Bangladesh*. Unpublished doctoral dissertation. The City University, London.

Satellite TV *VJs*. Its proprietor, *Mrs. Zeenat*, believes that 'beauty consciousness is the contribution of TV shows'. She says, in Gujranwala, it has become normal practice to visit the

beautician before attending any celebration and she believes TV has introduced this trend in a comparatively backward place'. In Gujranwala , fifty beauty parlours are doing comfortable business. In Lahore , there are more than 2100 beauty parlours and Karachi over 3500 and a number of these with state-of-the-art equipment.

Evidence from dress shops in big cities suggests that there is a roaring business in dresses popularized in Indian films, with the Karachi wholesalers dispatching them in volume once the film has become popular. These Indian movies are available to Pakistani audience through Cable TV. However, Ruby kiran of *Clifton Designs* in Karachi told me that whereas 'clients from the middle and lower classes mention clothes worn by actresses, higher class women—want their own exclusive designs.' She believes that TV is developing 'fashion literacy'; women are coming into the shop asking for 'hipsters' and 'tight-fit' fashions. She says, sales of dresses, including evening gowns, are running at 300 a month.

These new fashions encouraged by TV have provoked some criticism from traditionalists. The salesperson at D. Watson Cosmetics store, selling 300 lipsticks a day, has had to justify her activities to parents who object to her chosen work, 'I told them that I am doing nothing wrong. Beautifying one's face and body has a long Pakistani tradition.... The tradition is ancient; only the products have changed.' The proprietor of Guddi Beauty Parlour, put up the same defense, 'I do not think I am corrupting the culture of Pakistan . Beautifying oneself has been a long tradition in Pakistan . Mughal dresses and queens' dresses and cosmetics are a very well told story'.

The other obsession is cricket, which is a now preferred to traditional games in rural areas. The owner of an Islamabad general stores said that within three months, he had sold 400 bats marketed in the name of *Shahid Afridi* , the well-known cricketer. According to school teachers in Rawalpindi , 'Instead of gulli danda (a rural and semi urban sport of lower middle class) they have taken up cricket.. .the students are addicted to viewing one day cricket matches on the TV.... They know all the cricketers and their records. They know all the terms used to describe the game'.

In a lively debate, on Geo about the influence of television one man said, 'The young generation has gone astray because of over exposure to TV programs. They sing dirty songs,

Siddiqui, haider jamal. Interview, August 2007, Karachi

gesticulate in a dirty manner. Their ideals are not Quaid-i-Azam but *Shahrukh Khan* and *Sanjay Dutt* . Another reported, 'I do not agree with my friend. I find TV a good educational device. There are lots of informative programs. You will find the level of knowledge of the younger generation higher than us. It is a thousand times better to see programs on TV than to loiter around in the streets'.

Effects on Children

Akram Mughal and Shaukat Qureshi, who studied the impact of television advertising on children in Pakistan , present a case for real concern at the profound changes which have taken place in cultural attitudes among the television generation. According to their research, young

people spend an increasing number of hours watching TV and are enthralled by it. They say, TV is presenting consumerism as a way of life. Consumer non-durables are the easiest things to sell because they do not require a big investment. But advertisements for soft drinks and cosmetics boost the market for a whole range of consumer durables associated with 'modern' lifestyles.

Analyzing children's reaction to television advertisements, Qureshi and Mughal note that the push to individual consumption on a western pattern tends to undermine more traditional habits of sharing. Advertising promotes the nuclear family at the expense of the joint family. They argue that many children have begun to associate happiness with owning or possessing a toy or being indulged by their parents. During a discussion working class groups were in support of the view that parents are under pressure from their children to buy things. A group of working class women in Rawalpindi said they were influenced by advertisements, particularly for cosmetics and toiletries, with their children wanting them to try all sorts of new products. A small shopkeeper in Rawalpindi said of his son: 'If he wants, then he wants. There is no stopping him.' One boy in this group had even demanded a mobile phone from his father'.

Middle class housewives in Rawalpindi raised worries that children had become addicted to TV. 'If there is an interruption', said one, 'my child insists to call up the cable guy immediately'. Another mother recounted how her boy had seen an ice-cream advertisement at 10 p.m. the previous evening and demanded one immediately. Akbar', she said, 'my husband had to step out and buy it so he would stop crying.' Some of these groups were using TV as a means of amusing their children and paying a price for their absorption in the world of advertisements,

Akram Mughal and Shaukat Qureshi, (1999), Impact of Television Ads on Children: A research study Conducted for Ministry of Education, Government of Pakistan.

which many of them knew by heart. A similar group in Lahore revealed that in 'many houses the television is on all day, though viewing is concentrated at particular times. In these families, the children seemed to control the remote and were 'crazy to try advertised products'.

Poor teenagers from a Christian slum area of Islamabad proved to be very familiar with satellite TV programs. Most of these teenage boys and girls worked part time or full time; some went to the local government school. Several of them saw satellite TV as a strong aspirational influence. 'They show such goodies that I immediately want to acquire them', said Nazia, aged 14. 'The only question is where to get the money from...But I still love watching the advertisements and know by heart the names of all the items....' 'I like to watch movies and programs that show people rising from a low to a high position', said Anthony, aged 19. 'I wish they would show more programs like this which encourage many like us to continue our struggle.' Bashir, aged 16, said, 'I have learnt that America and England are the best places to be if you can get a job there. Then you can have access to all the things like imported jeans, shoes and of course Kentucky Fried Chicken and Pizza Hut'.

Qureshi and Mughal, in their analysis of TV advertising in Pakistan, note that in middle class households children also influence their parents' decisions on the purchase of big items such as refrigerators or cars. Advertisers know this and use this in their marketing strategy for adult consumer goods. According to the director of an advertising firm in Islamabad, 'Children are

exposed to advertising of products which have no connection to them, yet the parents are under mounting pressure to take their children's opinion into account when making any decision related to the purchase of goods. The advertising agencies have capitalized on this by coming up with many more advertisements directed at children'.

With the vast majority of households in Pakistan only having one TV set, it is not surprising to learn that children spend most of their time watching programs made for adults. But there is also a shortage of programs for children, both on PTV and the satellite channels. The only frequently mentioned children's programme was *Ainak Wala Jin* (a demon with spectacles) on PTV, with a central character modelled on Superman. The satellite channels are best known for their western cartoons, whose accessibility to Pakistan children has proved a cost effective means of reaching these audiences without commissioning any regionally specific alternatives. _____

Akram Mughal and Shaukat Qureshi, (1999), Impact of Television Ads on Children: A research study Conducted for Ministry of Education, Government of Pakistan.

The Gender Crisis

The evidence from one discussion groups suggested that new role models created by the satellite cable channels have been more influential in the larger cities than elsewhere. A group of women in Lahore felt that the serials on Zee by and large painted 'an unreal and perverted picture of women'. Two working class women took very strong objection to what they termed 'the misbehavior of young women in serials'. They claimed that their day-to-day life and reality was never shown in the serials or films. To them the women shown on the screen belonged to a very small affluent section of the Pakistani society, which is not at all representative.

Among the middle class, there is a definite following for the new soap operas. Middle class homemakers in Lahore expressed distaste for the new themes but admitted watching Indian Soap regularly. 'We are now hooked and I want to know the end', was one reaction. Another said: 'It shows a different story but such things are taking place in our society today.' Middle class students in Lahore were also watching these serials; they liked radical figures but disapproved extra marital relationship. Asked whether they found these serials bold, one of them replied, 'They are bold,'

A Pakistani classical dancer and TV personality Sheema Kirmani, believes that 'Pakistani women are coming into their own', but is also skeptical about satellite TV's progressive credentials. She says, 'the major impact of satellite TV has been on middle class women in terms of day-to-day behavior, dressing and language. This view is also supported by famous writer and poet *Fahmida Riaz*. She says women are getting more visibility, issues are getting more space, but there is too much stereotypical representation of their problems. In fact she sees satellite TV as subversive of women's fight for political emancipation. She says, it is a case of 'give them visibility and kill them' and she holds that invisibility would have been preferable.

In general the women appreciated the new bold woman, though they differed considerably over how the boldness was portrayed. An underlying concern among working women themselves was that their portrayal in the serials was 'extremely negative and problematic. One conclusion of

these discussions was that women's worlds are not reflected adequately on television and that something needs to be done to correct the imbalance.

Professional women in Islamabad wanted programs to show women playing a variety of roles. 'Women are shown in plays, entertainment and movies and are not much included in current affairs discussions, economic and political debates', said one participant. 'Television is not showing what our women are achieving', said another. 'Women should appear in the media in a diversity of roles, not a limited and stereotyped one', was a third opinion. According to Dr Huma Haque of Fatima Jinnah Women's University says, teleserials and plays are still 'perpetuating the same traditional image of a weak woman living happily within four walls'.

A study on the representation of women on the Pakistan Television also concluded that during prime time television 'women are represented primarily in their roles within the family and principally confined to the domestic sphere'. Its authors, *Dr Seema Parvez, Ashok Kumar and Yasser Noman* found this to be particularly true of teledramas. They say, many of them are 'rampant with gender stereotypes'. Very few critically consider issues such as oppression of women within the family or problems of domestic violence. Moreover, the few that do, such as the popular teledrama, *Ajaib Khana* which raised the issue of unequal marriages, fail to resolve them from a progressive angle. The authors also criticized western films for their 'culture of violence' against women and their representation as sex objects, 'they have no positive impact'. Their report argues that there is a need for 'clear and comprehensive guidelines on gender and the media, and television needs to promote role models 'founded on achievement and not on appearance' and that there is a need for more women in television management and more training in gender issues for media staff.

The Lonely Audience

Discussants in various cities and towns had consensus over decline in socializing. Family gatherings have grown less frequent as TV programs take priority and social interaction is often determined by what is on TV. A common complaint of parents is that children are glued to the television set and neglect their studies, though the supposed correlation between addiction to television and poor exam results is not easy to prove. Some parents have cable TV disconnected as exams approach, though most teachers argue that television, properly used, has widened children's horizons and helped them do better. The viewing and reading habits of parents are (in most cases) more significant determining factors than the presence or absence of a television set.

In Islamabad, it was not just parents who were complaining, school children were also annoyed that parents did not bother to sit down with them when they had difficulty with their homework. They would rather watch TV than talk to their children. Some of the strongest _____

Haq Huma, Indepth Interview, 9 January, 2007

Parvez Seema, Noman Yasser & Kumar Asok, (1998), Portrayal of Women in Pakistan Television programs, UNDP.

reactions to the new consumer culture come from religious leaders who see it undermining spirituality and with it, their place in society.

Pakistani parents of almost all backgrounds express worries about the greater incidence of sex, violence, bad language and bad behaviour on satellite television. There is concern that violence on the screen is producing copycat violence on the streets or in the classroom, that sexual gratification and promiscuity are being encouraged and that certain kinds of more explicit programs undermine family and traditional values. Parents and grandparents fear that children are losing their innocence by being exposed to unsuitable adult programs—especially the vulgarity of Indian Urdu film songs and the unnecessary violence and frankness of serials.

Family viewing of programs with bolder themes or franker treatment of sexuality is a source of embarrassment for most parents and some children. Speculation about the impact of television is common; though most of it cannot be confirmed when specific examples are sought. In discussion groups in Lahore, some participants wanted to blame television for girls running away with men of different ethnic groups and classes, though others pointed out that such things had happened before. Others talked of girls being raped in offices and workplaces, though no one was aware of any specific examples and the police had no records of such crimes. Such examples are symptomatic of general concerns about the impact of satellite television, which is reflecting the fractured world of advanced urban societies to localities with more conservative traditions.

Discussion groups commonly expressed the view that cable TV is responsible for growing promiscuity in society. TV is seen as the immediate culprit because of its visual presence discussing sex or portraying sexuality related activities. However, as groups examined the issue in more depth, they would generally modify their verdict, accepting that no media product alone can be responsible for something as basic as sexual behaviour patterns. Satellite television is part of a complex pattern of social change, but a number of professionals dealing with social and personal problems see it as a negative influence. Another worry for parents is the level of violence in Urdu films, teleserials and cartoons. One worried parent said, 'Even cartoons are no longer safe. Some of the characters have become so ridiculously violent that they are losing their suitability for children. Children are learning to kick and punch and use foul language.'

A discussion group accepted that violence in society had its origins in economic deprivation and social breakdown and could not be blamed solely on the media, but many discussants did blame TV for a process of violence. They held that people are willing to accept a greater degree of violence because of their exposure to it on TV. Some also believed that TV did influence the behavior of marginal players; those on the verge of assault or adultery may risk it under the influence of TV. There seems to be a class dimension to reactions to media violence. For the middle class, the level of violence in films is outside their normal experience, whereas for the working class it is not regarded as unusual.

Some discussants expressed concern that satellite television, which is targeting the middle class with expensive products, may be alienating working class and rural viewers and fuelling social unrest. But our research among working class families in Lahore and Rawalpindi found more evidence of prudence than of frustration and anger. These families, with a purchasing power of less than Rs 6,000 a month, all confront the dilemma that their children are constantly exposed to

advertisements for goods they cannot afford to buy. They were critical of many of the programs and of the advertisements, but they followed new products closely and exhibited a high rate of sampling, whether of soaps, shampoos, biscuits or chocolates.

All the discussions and data show that people are worried about the impact on others, not on themselves. The middle class is concerned about other people's children and about the impact on the working class. The working class, significantly, is concerned about what it sees as the growth of corruption in the middle class. A group of Rikshaw drivers and craftsmen interviewed in Karachi blamed the parents of rich children for conniving at indecent behaviour. They said, they were afraid that their children would be affected by rich adolescents. All of them were of the opinion that 'TV is responsible for the creeping corruption in society, but they also recognised 'some good effects' of TV. One said, he thought the dowry system was vanishing because of media exposure. He said, 'in my home everyone is convinced that this system is bad and outdated. I will try to marry my sons and daughters without dowry. This is the contribution of TV'.

Conclusion:

The emergence of new satellite culture has shown clearly that success in a large market like Pakistan requires a high degree of localization. The religious programs on Geo, Indus and ARY and transformation of Star TV and of the music channels is a clear proof of that. The success of some regional channels (like Zee TV) has been copied by GEO, ARY, Indus , and to some extent by PTV. Beyond the evident success of localization, there are important questions about the form and character it has taken. New collaborations between international and national business have generated a culture which follows western-style consumerism with the popularity of Bollywood and reaches a sizeable audiences. Its success has raised questions within Pakistan about the failure of national culture. On the mass entertainment channel like PTV, it is largely Pakistani culture which is being projected in a Pakistani version of globalization. Consequently, looking at the cultural impact of the satellite revolution in neighbouring countries brings into the picture questions not simply of popular culture but also of inherited political attitudes and relationships. The audience in Pakistan is struggling to place its position in terms of viewing and associating to the satellite TV programmes. The Hall's (1991) and Livingstone's (1990) categorization of *dominant* , *oppositional* and *negotiated* stances are scarcely applicable in total to various population groups, primarily owing to the fact that they react under the strict social and economic conditions. These conditions which are complex and overlapping in most cases, govern their behaviour to a large extent. The interaction with television discourses is highly symbolic and reactions are strongly subordinated by the meanings people pick from the cultural stock of knowledge at first instance and then attach to the messages.

In the field of Electronic Media new technological breakthroughs are expected in the coming five years which are likely to create yet new challenges. There is a need for building the capacity within Information and Broadcasting sector of reviewing the new trends, forces and innovations annually so that the country is not overtaken by events technologically. The era of technological predominance is knocking at our doors and in the words of Marshall McLuhan- the Media Guru, the worldwide relationship will be shaped by media technology in future. There is need for a Strategy Group in Information and Broadcasting sector to review the emerging challenges which

should submit an annual report to Government for speedy actions. Research Studies should be undertaken through Information related Institutes and Universities on the media scenario and its comparison with the rival forces. In addition to this, the role of regulation will have to be constantly redefined. Pakistan Electronic Media Regulatory Authorities' role in expanding and strengthening the media market and providing a workable policy model to operators with principles of social responsibility will be of foremost importance. It should perform this role through wide stakeholder consultation and recourse to the general public through authentic surveys.

References

- 1. Afshan Chowdhury, "Media Profile of Pakistan", commissioned for the Media Pakistan Project, July 1998.
- 2. Ahmad Kamran, (1999), Gender Sensitization workshop For Media Professionals, UNDP.
- 3. Akif, S. A., & Siddiqui, A.A. (Comp.), (1998), *Pakistan advertising scene (1997)*. Karachi : Orient McCann-Erickson.
- 4. Akram Mughal and Shaukat Qureshi, (1999), Impact of Television Ads on Children: A research study Conducted for Ministry of Education, Government of Pakistan.
- 5. Amartya Sen, "Culture, Freedom and Independence " in UNESCO World Culture
- 6. Ang, Ien (1985), *Watching Dallas: Soap Opera and the Melodramatic Imagination*, London : Methuen .
- 7. Ang, Ien (1990), *Desperately Seeking the Audience*, London : Routledge.
- 8. Anjali Monteiro and K.P. Jayasankar (2000), 'Between the Normal and the Imaginary: The Spectator Self, the Other and Satellite Television in India , in I. Hagen and J. Wasko. (eds), (2000).
- 9. Arnould, E. J. and Richard Wilk (1984), "Why do the Indians Wear Adidas?" *Advances in Consumer Research*, 11: 748-52.
- 10. Aslam Azhar, Islamabad , November 2006.
- 11. Auditor General of Pakistan (1998), "Performance Evaluation of Pakistan Television Corporation Ltd. Islamabad .
- 12. Bagchi, Jasodhara (1990), Representing Nationalism: Ideology of Motherhood in Colonial Bengal . *Economic and Political Weekly* 25 (42-3): WS 65-71.
- 13. Baig Hamid, Interview in Islamabad , October 2006.
- 14. CBC Ottawa Research, (1990), "Canadian Produced Programming for Canadian TV Audiences: How are we doing?"
- 15. CBC Research, (1991), "How People Use Television (A review of TV Viewing Habits)
- 16. College students, Islamabad , January 2006.
- 17. College students, Islamabad , June 2006.
- 18. Curran James & Gurevitch Michael (Ed.1997), *Mass Media and Society*, Arnold London .
- 19. Curran James and Gurevitch Michael, (1997), "Mass Media and Society", Arnold, A member of the Hodder Headline Group, London .
- D. Morley and K. Robins (1995), *Spaces of Identity: Global Media, Electronic Landscapes and Cultural Boundaries*, p. 11.

- 21. Dawn, 20 September, 2007.
- Dawn, 27 April, 2005.
- Denis McQuail (2000), *Mass Communication Theory*, Sage Publication, London .
- Drummond, Phillip and Richard Patterson eds. (1988), *Television and Its Audience: International Research Perspectives*. London : British Film Institute.
- Eighth Five-Year Plan; (1992-97), Planning Commission Of Pakistan
- Fashion and Ontology in Trinidad . *Culture and History*, 7: 49-78. (1990).
- Fachel, Jane (1988), The Concept of Live Television; Ontology as Ideology. In *Regarding Television: Critical Approaches - An Anthology*. E. A- Kaplan, ed., pp. 12-22. Frederick , MD : University Publications of America .
- Financial Times, 11 January 2004.
- Financial Times, 2 March 2005.
- Fiske, John (1986), "Television: Polysemy and Popularity." *Critical Studies in Mass Communications*, 3 (4): 391. 08. Friedman, Jonathan 1990, "The Political Economy of Elegance." *Culture and History*,
- 31. Focus Group Discussion, University students, Karachi , Pakistan , June 2005.
- Freedom House Survey(1999) USA
- Gudykunst B. William and Mody Bella, (2002), "Handbook of International and Intercultural Communication, Second Edition, Sage Publications, California .
- Gunaratne A. Shelton, (2000), "Hand Book of the Media in Asia", Sage Publication New Delhi .
- Gunaratne , S.A. (1970), Press in Pakistan under President Ayub Khan. *Gazette*, 16 (1), 39-53.
- Haider Jamal, (23-07-2002 and 12-08-2003), Interview

- Haider, N. (1990, June 5), The role of the press in Pakistan . *The Muslim* [11 th Anniversary Supplement], p. 6.
- Hall Stuart; (1973), "The Structural Communication of Events", Center for Cultural Studies, University of Birmingham , UK .
- Hall, B. (1991), An elaboration of the structural possibilities for engaging in alignment episodes. *Communication Monographs*, 58, 79-100.
- Hall, B. (1994), Understanding intercultural conflict through an analysis of kernel images and rhetorical visions. *International Journal of Conflict Management*, 5, 63-87.
- 41. Hall, S. (1973), *Encoding and Decoding in Television Discourse* , in CCCS occasional paper, Birmingham .
- Hall, S. (1977), Culture, the Media and the Ideological effect, in J. Curran (ed) *Mass communication and society* , London, Edward Arnold.
- Hall, S. (1980), Encoding/decoding In S. Hall, D. Hobson, A. Lowe, & C Paul Willis (eds.), *Culture, media, language: Working papers in cultural studies, 1972-1979* (pp. 128-138). London : Hutchinson .
- Hall, S. (1982), The Rediscovery of Ideology: Return of the repress in Media Studies, in M. Gurevitch, *Culture Society and the Media*, London , Methuen .
- Hall, Stuart (1981), Information and Broadcasting. Notes on Deconstructing "The Popular." In *People's History and Socialist Theory*. R. Samuel, ed., pp. 227-40. London : Routledge and Kegan Paul.
- Hamelink J. Cees; (1990), (1) "Democratizing Communication. A Human Rights Issue"

- Development, Rome , pp 1010-104. 1975. (2) The corporate Village, IDDC International Rome,
- Hamelink, C. (1994), *The Politics of World Communication*. London : Sage.
 - Ibid. On 7 January 2000 , the market capitalization of Time Warner was US\$ 76.4 billion, Disney US\$ 65.2 billion and CBS US\$ 44.2 billion.
 - Haq huma, Indepth Interview, 9 January, 2007
 - Iftikhar Arif, Islamabad , March 2006.
 - 51. Imam of Mosque, G – 9/4, Interview on 11-03-2007.
 - Interview with Working class, Islamabad , 02-02-2007.
 - Interviews with university Professor from Lahore , May 2007.
 - Iqbal Anwar (1997), Cultural Side of Advertisement, Ministry of Education, Islamabad .
 - Jabbar Javed, (1999), The Global City, Royal Book Company, Karachi .
 - Jabbar, J., & Isa, Q.F. (Comps.), (1997), *Mass media laws and regulations in Pakistan — And a commentary from a historical perspective*. Singapore : AMIC.
 - Jalil Aali, Interveiw Rawalpindi, March 2006.
 - James Lull ed. (1988), "Domestic Relations: The Framework of Family Viewing in Great Britain ." In *World Families Watch Television* , pp. 22-48. Beverly Hills , CA : Sage.
 - Jamil Khan Family, Interviewed in Islamabad November, 2006.
 - Jang, daily, Rawalpindi , 12-03-2007.
 - 61. Junaid Shahwar, (1995), Communication Media and Public Policy, Publishing consultants Rawalpindi .
 - Katz, E. and T. Liebes (1984), "Once Upon a Time, in Dallas ." *Inter media*, 12 (3): 46-72. ———1986 "Patterns of Involvement in Television Fiction: A Comparative Study." *European Journal of Communication*, 1 (2): 151-71.
 - Kirmani Shima, Interview in Karachi , August 2007.
 - Klapper J. T; (1960), The Effects of Mass Communication Glencoe, Free Press,
 - Kottak, Conrad (1990), *Prime Time Society*. Belmont , CA : Wadsworth . Leal, Ondina E. 1990, "Popular Taste and the Erudite Repertoire: The Place and Space of Television in Brazil ." *Cultural Studies*, 4 (I): 19-29.
 - Leal, G.T. (1990), Pakistan . In G.T. Kurian (Ed.), *World press encyclopedia* (pp. 707-714). London : Mansell Publishing.
 - Lee, Minu and Chong Heup Cho (1990), "Women Watching Together: An Ethnographic Study of Soap Opera Fans in the US ." *Cultural Studies*, 4 (I): 30-44. Leal (1990)
 - Liebes, T. and Katz, E. (1990), The Export of Meaning: Cross-Cultural Readings of Dallas , Oxford : Oxford University Press.
 - Mahmood, S., & Shaukat, N. (1993), *The constitution of the Islamic Republic of Pakistan* : Lahore : Lull (1948).
 - Malinowksi, B. (1935), *Coral gardens and their magic* (Vol. 2). London : Alien and Unwin.
 - 71. Malinowski Bronislaw (1944), "A Scientific Theory of Culture", A Galaxy Book, New York .
 - 75. Mansha Yad, Interview, July, 2007, Islamabad
 - 76. McQuail, D. and Siune, K. (1998), Media Policy: Convergence, Concentration and commerce. London . Sage.
 - 77. Mead, M. (1937), Public opinion mechanisms among primitive peoples. *Public Opinion Quarterly*, 1, 5-16.

- Mead, Margaret and Gregory Bateson. (1942), *Balinese Character: A Photographic Analysis*. New York : New York Academy of Sciences , 'special Publications II.
- Michaels, Eric (1988), " Hollywood Iconography: A Warlpiri Reading." In *Television and its Audience: International Research Perspectives*. Phillip Drummond and Richard Patterson, eds., pp. 109-24. London : BFI Publishing.
- Miller, Daniel (1987), *Material Culture and Mass Consumption*. Oxford : Blackwell Publishers.
- Miller, Daniel (1992), The Young and the Restless in Trinidad : A Case of the Local and the Global in Mass Consumption.' In R. Silverstone and E. Hirsch , eds. *Consuming Technologies: Media and Information in Domestic Spaces*. London and New York : Routledge, pp. 163-82.
- Morley, D. (1980), *The Nationwide Audience*. London : British Film Institute.
- Morley, D. (1988), *Family Television*, London : Rutledge.
- 81. Mowlana, H. (1985), *International Flows of Information*, Paris : UNESCO.
 - Nasir Agha, interview in Islamabad , April 2006.
 - Nation, Editorial, 05-04-2007 .
 - Nawaz Shuja; (1984), "Mass Media and Pakistan's Development, by S. J. Burki and Robert Laporte Jr. (eds), Oxford University Press, Karachi, pp 310-350.
 - News, daily, Editorial, 04-07-2006 .
 - Nizami Majeed, Interview at Lahore , 05-03-2006 .
 - Parvez Seema, Noman Yasser & Kumar Asok, (1998), *Portrayal of Women in Pakistan Television programs*, UNDP.
 - 'People's Perception: Obscenity and Violence on the Small Screen', (2003), sponsored by the National Commission for Women, Media Advocacy Group, Karachi .
 - Peterson Theodore and Jensen W. Jay; (1965), *The Mass Media and Modern Society*, N.Y.
 - Professionals, KARACHI , July 2007.
 - 91. Professionals, LAHORE , May 2007.
 - Professionals, RAWALPINDI , August 2007.
 - Qasmi Ataul Haque, Jang, April 2007.
 - Qudsia Bano, Interview in Lahore , December, 2006.
 - Rana,A.waheed and Iqbal,Anwar(2006)*Social Impact of Global satellite Broadcasting in Pakistan* , Quaid-I-Azam University Islamabad
 - Rabia Family, Interviewed in Islamabad , May 2006.
 - Rana & Iqbal; (1996), *Television in Pakistan* , Institute of Social Research, Islamabad , (A Study of television in Pakistan conducted for IDRC, Canada)
 - *Report of the press commission*. (1959), Karachi : Government of Pakistan .
 - Riaz Fahmida, Interview in Karachi , August 2007.
 - Rizvi, S. (1990). Pakistan . In C.J. Hamelink and A. Mehra (Eds.) *Communication development and human rights in Asia* (pp. 69-86), Singapore : AMIC.
 - Sajid, Z. (1996), *Media monitors in Pakistan* . In K.S. Venkateswaran (Comp.). *Media monitors in Asia* (pp. 51-54), Singapore : AMIC.
 - Saif Saleem Ahmed, Afro Asia , 27 June 1985 .
 - School children, Rawalpindi , June 2006.
 - Schoolchildren, KARACHI , May 2006.
 - Shahnaz Family, Interviewed in Islamabad August 2006.

- Shamsuddin, M. (1986), *British press coverage and the role of Pakistani press from independence to the emergence of Bangladesh* . Unpublished doctoral dissertation. The City University , London .
- Siddiqui, I. (1991), *Radio journalism in Pakistan* . Lahore : Feroz Sons (Pvt) Ltd.
- Siddiqui, haider jamal. Interview, August 2007, Karachi
- Singhar, monthly, April 2006, Lahore
- Stevenson L Robert; (1988), *Communication Development and the Third World* Long man, N.Y.
- Students, Pilot School , RAWALPINDI , August 2006.
- Tahir, S.N. (1996), *Television in Pakistan : An overview*. In D. French and M. Richards (Eds.), *Contemporary television: Eastern perspectives* (pp. 113-131). New Delhi : Sage Publications.
- Wilk, Richard (1993), "It's Destroying a Whole Generation": Television and Moral Discourse in Belize .' *Visual Anthropology* 5: 229-44.
- Williams, R. (1985), *Towards 2000*, London , Penguin.
- Williams, R. (1987), 'The press we don't deserve', in J. Curran, *The British Press: A Manifesto*, London , Macmillan.
- Williams, R. (1988), 'Culture is ordinary', in *Resources of Hope*, London .
- Williams, R. (1989a), 'A defense of realism', in *What I Came to Say*, London , Hutchinson .
- Williams, R. (1989b), 'Isn't the news terrible?', in *What I Came to Say*, London , Hutchinson .
- Williams, R. (1989c), *The Politics of Modernism: Against the New Conformists*, London , Verso.
- Williams, R. and Orrom, M. (1954), *Preface to Film*, London , Film Drama.
- Women labourers, Lahore and Rawalpindi , May and August 2006.
- Women professionals and activists, Islamabad , May 2006.
- Yawar Hayat, Interviewed in Lahore , December 2006.

About the Authors

Dr Abdul Waheed Rana

Dr Abdul Waheed Rana studied at Quaid-e-Azam University Islamabad , University of Ottawa , Canada and University of Oslo , Norway . He earned a Ph.D by doing a comprehensive research on Cultural Communication and Television. His special fields of interest include; modern mass media systems and their impact on culture. Dr Rana has so far published two books – one on Anthropological thoughts and debates and other a collection of his short stores. He has done extensive research on television for IDRC Canada and Higher Education Commission, Pakistan . Dr Rana has worked as Radio and TV broadcaster for over two decades. He is currently working in the Mass Media and Culture Wing of Planning Commission of Pakistan. He also teaches Anthropology and Mass Media at Quaid-e-Azam University , Islamabad .

Dr S. Anwar Iqbal

Dr Anwar Iqbal is currently associated with Department of Anthropology, Quaid-e-Azam University , Islamabad . He earned a Ph.D by writing a thesis on expatriate Pakistanis and their contribution in national economy. Dr Anwar Iqbal has written over twelve research papers which have been published in national and international journals. He is member of International Body on |World Religions and a number of other development and research Organizations. Dr Anwar is the author of more than twenty research reports on development projects. He has been Head of research projects sponsors by IDRC, Canada , HEC and Asian Development Bank. He was the Bureau Chief of widely circulated Urdu language newspapers – Urdu Times, published from USA and Canada , for five years.